

Tables 1-2 provide details of the physical and socio-economic indicators of sustainability for five of the World's largest cities

Table 1: Physical science indicators for Toronto, Sao Paulo, Shanghai, Mumbai and Dakar

Physical Science Indicators ¹	Unit	Global	Cities Average ²	Toronto	Sao Paulo	Shanghai	Mumbai	Dakar
Carbon Dioxide Emission								
GHG emissions per capita	(tCO ₂ /cap/year)	4.71	6	11.5 [1]	1.5 [2]	11.7 [2]	2.7	1 ³
Rate of Biodiversity Loss								
Ecological footprint (Global hectares demanded per capita)	ha	1.7	2.8	6.5	3	2.1	1.1	1.5
Index of biodiversity impact			2.9	2.8	2.8	3.5	3	2.3
Fresh Water Use								
Total per capita water consumption	L/cap/day	100	267	431 [3]	175 [2]	411 [2]	250 [2]	69 [4]
Percent of city with potable water supply	%	81	95	100 [3]	92 [2]	98 [2]	96 [2]	90 [4]
Index of embodied water consumption			2.4	3.5	2.5	3	2	1
Change In Land Use								
Local land use change	% of cropland area	11.7	31	39 [5]	24	30 [6]	42	19.5 [7]
Population density	person/km ²	3500	2927	850 [5]	2503 [2]	2902 [2]	4225 [2]	4122[8]
Index of global land use impact			2.4	3.5	2.5	3	2	1
Nitrogen Cycle								
Per capita as % of global values based on estimated consumption patterns	kg-N ₂ /cap/year	18	23	36	25	29	21	6
Chemical Pollution								
Percentage of city population with regular solid waste collection	%	50	76	100	90 [2]	82 [2]	32.8 [2]	75 [9]
Percentage of city population served by wastewater collection	%	76	76	100	99 [2]	73 [2]	42 [2]	64 [10]
PM 2.5; PM 10; O ₃	µg/m ³	20	82	18.7 [11]	28 [12]	81	202 [2]	81 [13]
Geophysical Risk								
Number of natural disaster related deaths	per 100,000 pop.	0.134	0.2	0.01	0.05 [14]	0.06 ⁴ [15]	0.3 ⁵ [16]	0.4 ⁶ [15]
Percentage of GDP loss due to natural disasters	%	0.2	0.4	0.5	0.1	0.3 ⁷		1 [17]
Resilience of city		57	57	100	51	52	44	37
¹ Data highlighted in grey are estimates. ² Average of the 5 major cities. ³ Based on Senegal's urban GHG emissions. ⁴ China, 2011. ⁵ State of Maharashtra, 2012. ⁶ Senegal, 52 deaths in 2012. ⁷ Country scale								

Table 2: Socio-economic indicators for Toronto, SPMR, Shanghai, MMR and Dakar

Indicators	GTA	SPMR	Shanghai	MMR	Dakar
Youth Opportunity					
Under 5 mortality	6.4 ¹ [18]	22[19]	1.1[2]	40 [20]	53
Gender equity	0.74	0.37	0.81 [21]	0.7 [20]	0.44
Percentage of female in schools	0.91 [22]	95	97.3	87.15	68
Youth unemployment rate	18.1[23]	17.7 [24]	0.68 [25]	11	14.8 [26]
Average life expectancy	80	69	82	68 [2]	61 [26]
Economy					
Unemployment rate	8.6 [27]	5.2 [28]	4.2 [2]	11.7	30
Gini Coefficient	0.33 [29]	0.61 [30]	0.45 [2]	0.35 [2]	0.39
Percentage of population living in slums	0	20 [31]	31 [31]	37.7	35 [9]
GDP	51300	22700 [2]	19100 [2]	6700	3700
Energy Access and Intensity					
Percentage of city with authorized electrical service	100	99.9[2]	99 [2]	95 [2]	96 [9]
Percentage of city with access to clean energy for cooking	100	99	99	68.6	90
Energy Intensity	24.6 [32]	5 [2]	14.8 [2]	6.5 [2]	10.2
Mobility and Connectivity					
Number of personal automobiles per capita	0.61	0.31 [2]	0.13[33]	0.036 [2]	0.017
Daily number of public transport trips per capita	0.25 [34]	0.9	0.83	0.63	0.5
Number of internet connections	83 ^b	50	63.1	65	53
Percentage of commuters using a travel mode other than a personal vehicle to work	23 [35]	71	78 [2]	94	88
Transportation fatalities	2.5 [36]	7.8	6.3	34.2	17.2
Commercial air connectivity					
Institutions					
Ease of Doing Business – World Bank (downscaled from country to city level) ^b	19	116	96	134	178
Number of convictions for corruption by city officials ^b	81	42	40	36	41
Tax collected as a percent of tax billed					
Debt service ratio					
Basic Services					
Percentage of population with regular solid waste collection	100	90[2]	82.3 [2]	32.8 [2]	75 [9]
Percentage of city population served by wastewater collection	100	99.1 [2]	72.5 [2]	42 [2]	64 [10]
Percentage of population served with potable water supply	100	92 [2]	98 [2]	96	97 [10]
Security and Public Safety					
Number of fire related deaths	0.44[37]	0.5	0.3 [38]	1.65 [16]	3.2 [39]
Number of homicides	2 [40]	64.8 [30]	1.4 [2]	1.2 [41]	8.7 [31]
Violent crime rate					
¹ Infant mortality rate.					
^b Country level					

References

- [1] Anu Ramaswami, Shobhakar Dhakal, Sebastian Carney, and Christopher A. Kennedy, 2011, *Greenhouse Gas Emission Baselines for Global Cities and Metropolitan Regions*, in: *Cities and Climate Change: Responding to an Urgent Agenda*, Eds., M. F. Daniel Hoorweg, Marcus J. Lee, Perinaz Bhada-Tata, Belinda Yuen,
- [2] Danile Hoorweg, and Mila Freire, 2013, "Building Sustainability in an Urbanizing World " The World Bank, Report # 80106.
- [3] Siemens, 2011, "Us and Canada Green City Index: Assessing the Environmental Performance of 27 Major Us and Canadian Cities," Siemens AG, Report #
- [4] Global Water Intelligence, 2011, Pinsent Masons Water Yearbook 2011-2012: Senegal, Global Water Intelligence, August 28, 2014, <http://www.globalwaterintel.com/pinsent-masons-yearbook/2011-2012/part-ii/52/>
- [5] Wikipedia, 2014, Greater Toronto Area, Wikipedia, August 27, 2014, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Greater_Toronto_Area
- [6] Junxiang Li, Cheng Li, Feige Zhu, Conghe Song, and Jianguo Wu, 2013, "Spatiotemporal Pattern of Urbanization in Shanghai, China between 1989 and 2005," *Landscape Ecology*, 28, pp. 1545-1565.
- [7] Koffigan E. Adigbli, 2012, *Developing Senegal's Urban Agriculture*, Inter Press Service (IPS), August 28, 2014, <http://www.ipsnews.net/2012/11/developing-senegals-urban-agriculture/>
- [8] Hyoung Gun Wang, Marisela Montoliu-Munoz, the Geoville Group, and Ndèye Fatou D. Gueye, 2009, *Preparing to Manage Natural Hazards and Climate Change Risks in Dakar, Senegal*, The World Bank, Washington.
- [9] Touria Dafrallah, 2012, "Access to Electricity in Dakar: Role and Barriers to Renewable Energy Technology Diffusion," IRENA Workshop Renewables for Growing Cities in Africa, September 2, 2012, Naples.
- [10] C. Torres, C.M. Briceno-Garmednia, and C. Dominguez, 2011, *Senegal's Infrastructure: A Continental Perspective. africa Infrastructure Country Diagnostic*, The World Bank, Washington.
- [11] Ministry of Environment and Climate Change, 2014, Air Quality Ontario, Ministry of Enviroment and Climate Change, August 14, 2014, <http://www.airqualityontario.com/>
- [12] Regina Maura de Miranda, Maria de Fatima Andrade, Adalgiza Fornaro, Rosana Astolfo, Paulo Afonso de Andre, and Paulo Saldiva, 2012, "Urban Air Pollution: A Representative Survey of Pm2.5 Mass Concentrations in Six Brazilian Cities," *Air Quality, Atmosphere & Health*, 5, pp. 63-77.
- [13] Stéphanie Val, Cathy Liousse, El Hadji Thierno Doumbia, Corinne Galy-Lacaux, Hélène Cachier, Nicolas Marchand, Eric Gardrat Anne Badel, Alexandre Sylvestre, and Armelle Baeza-Squiban, 2013, "Physico-Chemical Characterization of African Urban Aerosols (Bamako in Mali and Dakar in Senegal) and Their Toxic Effects in Human Bronchial Epithelial Cells: Description of a Worrying Situation," *Particle and Fibre Toxicology*, 10, pp. 1-16.

- [14] Irineu de Brito Jr, Bruno César Kawasaki, Adriana Leiras, and Hugo Tsugunobu Yoshida Yoshizaki, 2011, "The Profile of the Population Affected by Natural Disasters in Brazil," eds., Chicago, pp. 025-1388.
- [15] Debarati Guha-Sapir, Philippe Hoyois, and Regina Below, 2013, *Annual Disaster Statistical Review 2012: The Numbers and Trends*, Université catholique de Louvain-World Health Organization,
- [16] National Crime Records Bureau, 2013, *Accidental Deaths and Suicides in India 2012*, Ministry of Home Affairs, Government of India, New Delhi.
- [17] The World Bank, 2012, Senegal Makes Disaster Preparedness a Priority, The World Bank, August 28, 2014, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2012/09/12/senegal-makes-disaster-preparedness-a-priority>
- [18] City of Toronto, 2013, Population Health Statistics, City of Toronto, August 15, 2014, <http://www.toronto.ca/health/statistics/>
- [19] City of Sao Paulo, 2014, Infant Mortality in São Paulo, Technical Department of Health Child and Adolescent, August 28, 2014, <http://www.capital.sp.gov.br/portal/secoes/nav-cidadao/#/MSwzNiwxMTUzLDEwNDQ=>
- [20] Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai, 2010, *Mumbai Human Development Report 2009*, Oxford University Press, New Delhi.
- [21] Xu Junqian, 2013, Shanghai Women Enjoy Most Privileges: Survey, China Daily, August 28, 2014, http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/china/2013-04/12/content_16396838.htm
- [22] Statistics Canada, 2013, Women and Education, Government of Canada, August 15, 2014, <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/89-503-x/2010001/article/11542-eng.htm>
- [23] CBC, 2013, Ontario's Youth Unemployment among Worst in Canada, CBC News, August 15, 2014, <http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/kitchener-waterloo/ontario-s-youth-unemployment-among-worst-in-canada-1.1872206>
- [24] Antonio José Junqueira Botelho Judith Mariscal, Luis H. Gutiérrez, 2008, *Information and Communication Technology (ICTs) Training, Employment and Youth: The Case of Brazil, Colombia and Mexico*, Center for Information and Society, Peru.
- [25] Zhao Wen, 2014, Youth Unemployment Down 23%, Shanghai Daily, August 28, 2014, <http://www.shanghaidaily.com/metro/society/Youth-unemployment-down-23/shdaily.shtml>
- [26] United Nations, 2013, "The Millennium Development Goals Report," United Nations, Report #
- [27] City of Toronto, 2013, Labour Force, Education, Place of Work, Commuting and Mobility, City of Toronto, August 15, 2014, https://www1.toronto.ca/city_of_toronto/social_development_finance__administration/files/pdf/nhs-backgrounder-labour-education-work-commuting.pdf
- [28] Joana Taborda, 2014, Brazil Unemployment Rate, Trading Economics, August 28, 2014, <http://www.tradingeconomics.com/brazil/unemployment-rate>
- [29] Cities Center, 2010, "Inequality in Toronto," Cities Center, Report # Discussion Paper 3.

- [30] Johannes Rehner Ricardo Jordán, Joseluis Samaniego, Metropolitan Cities Sustainability, CEPAL, August 28, 2014, <http://www.cepal.org/dmaah/noticias/paginas/8/35798/01-03-Rehner.pdf>
- [31] United Nations, 2010, *State of the World's Cities 2010/2011: Bridging the Urban Divide*, United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-HABITAT), Kenya.
- [32] Clarissa Binkley, Marianne Touchie, and Kim Pressnail, 2013, Energy Consumption Trends of Multi-Unit Residential Buildings in the City of Toronto, University of Toronto, August 15, 2014, <http://www.towerwise.ca/wp-content/uploads/2013/07/TAF-MURB-Energy-Performance-Report-Phase-II.pdf>
- [33] Jiaying Zhao, Edward Jow-Ching Tu, Christine McMurray, and Adrian Sleigh, 2012, "Rising Mortality from Injury in Urban China: Demographic Burden, Underlying Causes and Policy Implications," *Bull World Health Organ*, 90, pp. 461-467.
- [34] Pembina, Toronto and Cma, Pembina, August 14, 2014, <https://www.pembina.org/reports/coolest-cities-case-study-toronto.pdf>
- [35] Data Management Group, 2014, Transportation Tomorrow Survey 2011, University of Toronto, August 15, 2014, http://www.dmg.utoronto.ca/pdf/tts/2011/2011od_report_full.pdf
- [36] David Hains, 2014, Toronto's Bad Year for Traffic Fatalities, TORONTOIST, August 15, 2014, <http://torontoist.com/2014/01/torontos-bad-year-for-traffic-fatalities/>
- [37] Toronto Fire Services, 2014, *Toronto Fire Services – 2013 Annual Report*, City of Toronto, Toronto.
- [38] Yang Lizhong, Chen Heng, Yang Yong, and Fang Tingyong, "The Effect of Socioeconomic Factors on Fire in China," *Journal of Fire Sciences*, 23, pp. 251-267.
- [39] United Nations, 2014, *Life Expectancy at Birth*, United Nations, New York.
- [40] Toronto Police Service, 2012, *Annual Statistical Report*, City of Toronto, Toronto.
- [41] United Nations, 2014, *Global Study on Homicide 2013*, United Nations Publications, Vienna.

Jeffrey S. Boyce Research Group in Natural Gas (NG) as a Transportation Fuel
Faculty of Energy Systems and Nuclear Science
University of Ontario Institute of Technology
2000 Simcoe St. North, Oshawa, ON Canada
Tel: +1 905 721 8668 (5560)
<http://sites.uoit.ca/sustainabilitytoday/>